BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 09565687 2

UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Materials for

# LAW AND MULTICULTURALISM

Fall 2014

Perspectives/ICT/SUYRP course

## VOLUME I

Professor Ayelet Shachar
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

KE
4395
.S422
2014a
v.1
c.1

e materials reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law, and are not for commercial sale or use.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 27 2014
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

https://archive.org/details/materialsforlawm01shac_0

UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Materials for

# LAW AND MULTICULTURALISM

Fall 2014

Perspectives/ICT/SUYRP course

VOLUME I

**Professor Ayelet Shachar**
**Faculty of Law**
**University of Toronto**

The materials reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law, and are not for commercial sale or use.

Evaluation

Regular class attendance (10%), substantive participation in weekly discussions (20%), and a twenty-four hour take-home examination (70%) which may be signed-out between 9:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. for a 24 hour period during the examination period, Monday to Friday, excluding weekends to the Faculty's deadline for first term written work.

## VOLUME ONE

### I. FOUNDATIONS

#### 1 Introduction

Objectives and design of the course.

*Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, s 27, *Part I of the Constitution Act, 1982*, being Schedule B to the *Canada Act 1982* (UK), 1982, c 11 .....1

*Canadian Multiculturalism Act*, R.S.C. 1985, c. 24 (4th Supp.) .....2

Bill 60, *Charter affirming the values of State secularism and religious neutrality and of equality between women and men and providing a framework for accommodation requests*, 1st Sess, 40th Leg., Québec, National Assembly, 2013 .....12

Erazo v Dufferin-Peel Catholic District School Board 2014 ONSC 2072 .....19

Caroline Alphonso, "Board won't appeal ruling exempting Catholic students from mass," *The Globe and Mail*, April 23, 2014 .....31

#### 2 Why Accommodate? Justifications and Tensions

*Santa Clara Pueblo et al v Martinez et al*, 436 US 49 (1978) .....33

Will Kymlicka, *Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority Rights* (Oxford University Press, 1995) 10-44 .....40

Ayelet Shachar, *Multicultural Jurisdictions: Cultural Differences and Women's Rights* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001) 17-44 .....59

Martha Minow, "Identities" 3 *Yale Journal of Law & the Humanities* 97 (1991) .....75

## II. ILLUSTRATIONS: CONTESTED SOCIAL AND LEGAL ARENAS

### 3 Citizenship and the Boundaries of Religious Accommodation in the Public Sphere – Canada, France, and Beyond


Ayelet Shachar, "Interpretation Sections (27 and 28) of the Canadian Charter" in *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms,* eds., Errol Mendes and Stephane Beaulac (5th ed., LexisNexis, Canada, 2013), pp. 147-164 .....109

Rogers Brubaker, "Citizenship as Social Closure," in *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany* (Harvard University Press, 1992) 21-34 .....119

"France/Secularism," *Statement made by President Jacques Chirac,* France, 28 January 28 2004 .....135

Ayelet Shachar, "Religion, State, and the Problem of Gender: New Modes of Citizenship and Governance in Diverse Societies," 50 *McGill Law Journal* 49 (2005) .....136

Patrick Weil, "A nation in diversity: France, Muslims and the headscarf" *Open Democracy* (25 March 2004) .....147

John Bowen, "How the French State Justifies Controlling Muslim Bodies: From Harm-Based to Value-Based Reasoning" 78 *Social Research* 325 (2011).....153

*Multani v Commission scolaire Marguerite-Bourgeoys,* 2006 SCC 6, [2006] 1 SCR 256 .....177

Note on *Goldman v Weinberger,* 475 US 503 (1986) in Geoffrey R Stone et al, *Constitutional Law,* 4th ed. (Aspen Law & Business, 2001) 1473-1474 .....194

Micah Schwartzman, Richard Schragger and Nelson Tebbe, "The New Law of Religion," *Slate.com* (July 3, 2014) .....197

Anna Su, "The Good News According to *Hobby Lobby*" *Religion & Politics* (July 2, 2014) .....200

4 The Retreat from Multiculturalism?

Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "Discover Canada: The Rights and Responsibilities of Citizenship" *Citizenship and Immigration Canada* (2010) .....204

"Canadian History a Strong Point with Newcomers," *CBC News*, December 27, 2011 .....211

Liav Orgad, "Illiberal Liberalism: Cultural Restrictions on Migration and Access to Citizenship in Europe" 58 *American Journal of Comparative Law* 53 (2010) .....212

*Alberta v Hutterian Brethren of Wilson Colony*, 2009 SCC 37 .....236

*R v N.S.*, 2012 SCC 72 .....240

Pascale Fournier and Erica See, "The 'Naked Face' of Secular Exclusion: Bill 94 and the Privatization of Belief," 30 *Windsor Yearbook of Access to Justice* 63 (2012) .....253

Ayelet Shachar, "Interpretation Sections (27 and 28) of the Canadian Charter" in *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, eds., Errol Mendes and Stephane Beaulac (5th ed., LexisNexis, Canada, 2013), pp. 165-178 .....255

Christopher McCrudden, "Multiculturalism, Freedom of Religion and the British Constitution: The *JFS Case* Considered" 9 *International Journal of Constitutional Law* 200 (2011) .....263

5 Community, Education and Diversity

Avishai Margalit & Moshe Halbertal, "Liberalism and the Right to Culture" 71 *Social Research* 529 (2004) .....293

*Wisconsin v Yoder*, 406 US 205 (1972) .....294

William A. Galston, "Two Conceptions of Liberalism" 105 Ethics 516 (1995) .....297

"Accommodations for Religious Observances" (2012), online: University of Toronto <http://www.viceprovoststudents.utoronto.ca/publicationsandpolicies/guidelines/religiousobservances.htm> .....316

Vanessa MacDonnell, "Developments in Constitutional Law: The 2011-2012 Term" *Supreme Court Law Review* 2d 51, 86-90 (2012) .....318

Christopher Hunter, "The Positive Role for Government in Freedom of Religion," *The Court*, Feb 28, 2012 .....323

"A Momentous Case for Religious Freedom in Education" Loyola High School's Case) *R v Jones* [1986] 2 SCR 284.....327

Paolo Ronchi, "Crucifixes, Margin of Appreciation and Consensus: The Grand Chamber Ruling in *Lautsi v Italy*" 13 *Ecclesiastical Law Journal* 287 (2011) .....338

Lorenzo Zucca, "*Lautsi:* A Commentary on a decision by the ECtHR Grand Chamber" 11 *International Journal of Constitutional Law* 218 (2013) .....349

*Lautsi v Italy* [GC], No 30814/06, [2011] ECHR .....361

S M Corbett, "*Adler v Ontario* – The Troubling Legacy of A Compromise" 8 *Constitutional Forum* 64 (1997) .....364

## VOLUME TWO

6 Where Do Children Belong? Custody and Visitation; "Identity" Matters

Linda J Lacey, "Liberal Thought and Religion in Custody and Visitation Cases," in Stephen M Feldman, ed., *Law and Religion: A Critical Anthology* (New York: NYU Press, 2000) 411 .....1

*Kimberly Van De Perre v Theodore Edwards* [2001] 2 SCR 1014 .....10

The Indian Child Welfare Act of 1978 [United States] ..... 34

*Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians v Holyfield*, 409 US 30 (1989) .....38

Ayelet Shachar, "Demystifying Culture" 10 *International Journal of Constitutional Law* 429 (2012) .....41

Bethany R Berger, "In the Name of the Child: Race, Gender and Economics In *Adoptive Couple v Baby Girl*" *Florida Law Review* (2014, Forthcoming) .....51

7 **Medical Decisions; Mature Minors' Right to Die?**

*Re J (An Infant): B and B v Director General of Social Welfare* [1996] NZLR 134 [New Zealand] .....113

Zenon M Bodnaruk et al, "Meeting the Clinical Challenge of Care for Jehovah's Witnesses" 18 *Transfusion Medicine Reviews* 105 (2004) .....121

Rick Pedersen, "Don't Force Transfusions, Court Told", *National Post* (25 August 2003) A7 .....131

*Alberta (Director of Child Welfare) v H (B)* [2002] Alta D 360.25.70.20-02 ..... 132

Jenny Percival & Paul Lewis, "Teenager who won right to die: 'I have had too much trauma'", *The Guardian* (11 November 2008) .....145

Don Ellis, "We told her we loved her", *The Guardian* (12 November 2008) .....147

8 **Customary and Religious Personal Laws; Marriage and Divorce; Privatizing Diversity: Faith-Based Tribunals in a Constitutional State?**

David L. Chambers, "Civilizing the Natives: Marriage in Post-Apartheid South Africa" 129 *Daedalus* 101 (2000) .....149

*Reference re Section 293 of the Criminal Code of Canada*, 2011 BCSC 1588 .....173

Marie-Aimee Helie-Lucas, "The Preferential Symbol for Islamic Identity: Women in Muslim Personal Laws," in Valentine M Moghadam, ed., *Identity Politics and Women* (Westview Press, 1994) 391 .....176

Ayelet Shachar, *Multicultural Jurisdictions: Cultural Differences and Women's Rights* (Cambridge University Press, 2001) 45-62 .....187

*Mohd Ahmed Khan v Shah Bano Begum*, AIR 1985 SC 945 [India] .....193

Samia Bano, "Muslim and South Asian Women: Customary Law and Citizenship in Britain," in Nira Yuval-Davis and Pnina Werbner, eds., *Women, Citizenship, and Difference* (Zed Books, 1999) 162-177 .....205

"Darul-Qada: Beginnings of Muslim Civil Justice System in Canada" *The Canadian Society of Muslims* (April 2003) .....214

*Arbitration Act*, SO C 1991, c 17 ss.6, 17-20 .....217

"Position Statement on the Proposed Implementation of Sections of Muslim Law [Sharia] in Canada" *Canadian Council of Muslim Women* (25 May 2004) .....220

Marion Boyd, "Religiously-Based Alternative Dispute Resolution: A Challenge to Multiculturalism"(2006) *Canadian Diversity* .....227

Ministry of the Attorney General, *Backgrounder: The Family Statute Law Amendment Act, 2005* (15 November 2005) .....232

*Family Arbitration*, O Reg 134/07 .....234

David Pearl & Werner Menski, "Informal Muslim Dispute Settlement Processes," in *Muslim Family Law* (Sweet and Maxwell, 1998), 77-80 .....238

III INSTITUTIONAL AND PARTICIPATORY ATTEMPTS TO REDUCE THE TENSIONS BETWEEN EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY

9 **Internal Change, Legal Innovation, and Regulated Interaction**

Kecia Ali, "Acting on a Frontier of Religious Ceremony" 32 *Harvard Divinity Bulletin* 8 (2004) .....241

Daood Hamdani, "Can Women Change the Face of North American Mosques?" *CGNews* (20 July 2012) .....246

Ayelet Shachar, "Feminism and Multiculturalism: Mapping the Terrain," in David Owen & Anthony Laden, eds., *Multiculturalism and Political Theory* (Cambridge University Press, 2007) 130-136 .....248

*Bruker v Marcovitz* [2007] 3 SCR 607 .....253

Ran Hirschl, "Constitutional Courts vs. Religious Fundamentalism: Three Middle Eastern Tales" 82 *Texas Law Review* 1819 (2014) .....281

Howard Kislowicz, "Judging the Rules of Belonging," 44 *UBC Law Review* 287 (2011) .....296

10 International Law, Norm Diffusion, and the Recognition/Regulation of Diversity

*Lovelace v. Canada* UN GOAR, 36th Sess., Supp. No. 40, UN Doc. A/36/40 (1981) .....333

Steven Vertovec, "'Diversity' and the Social Imaginary" 53 *European Journal of Sociology* 287 (2012) .....342

Zachary Elkins, Tom Ginsburg & Beth Simmons, "Getting to Rights: Treaty Ratification, Constitutional Convergence, and Human Rights Practice" 54 *Harvard International Law Journal* 61 (2013) .....362

Galit Sarfaty, "International Norm Diffusion in the Pimicikamak Cree Nation: A Model of Legal Mediation" 48 *Harvard International Law Journal* 441 (2008) .....370

Epilogue

Salman Rushdie, "Good Advice is Rarer than Rubies" in *East, West: Stories* (Vintage International, 1994), 5-16 .....392